## Appendix 3: Comparison Table of Ecosystem Health vs Human Health Indicators (as of March 2009)

This comparison table includes Canadian federal, provincial and large-scale watershed (regional level) fresh-water ecosystem health and human health indicators. Some examples of small-scale watershed (community level) indicators are also included. Note: Indicators under development (red text) are included in the final tally in the main report.

| AGENCY INITIATIVE  | ECOSYSTEM HEALTH INDICATORS  | HUMAN HEALTH INDICATORS  |
|--|--|--|
| FEDERAL LEVEL  |  |  |
| Agriculture and Agri-Foods<br>Canada - Agri-Environmental<br>Indicators (AEIs) | <ul> <li>Water Quality</li> <li>Risk of Water Contamination by<br/>Nitrogen</li> <li>Risk of Water Contamination by<br/>Phosphorus</li> <li>Risk of Water Contamination by<br/>Pesticides - under development</li> <li>Risk of Water Contamination by<br/>Pathogens - early stages of<br/>development</li> </ul> | -  |
| Canadian Council of Ministers for the Environment (CCME)                       | Water Quality Index (WQI) for the<br>protection of aquatic life  | -  |
| Canadian Councils of Resource<br>Ministers (CCRM)                              | <ul> <li>Freshwater Quality Index for the<br/>Protection of Aquatic Life - under<br/>development</li> </ul>  | -  |
| Canadian Environmental<br>Sustainability Indicators (CESI)                     | Freshwater Quality Index for the<br>Protection of Aquatic Life   | -  |
|  |  | <ul> <li>Source and treated water quality - under<br/>development</li> <li>Agricultural Water Quality - under<br/>development</li> </ul> |
| Canadian Water Sustainability<br>Index (CWSI)                                  | Ecosystem Health <ul> <li>Stress</li> <li>Quality</li> <li>Fish</li> </ul>   | Human health <ul> <li>Reliability</li> <li>Access</li> </ul>   |
| Convention on Biological<br>Diversity  | Water quality of freshwater ecosystems   | -  |

| Environment Canada   | Source Water Vulnerability Index - under  | Source Water Vulnerability Index - under   |
|--|---|--|
|  | development   | development  |
| Natural Resources Canada   | Groundwater Vulnerability Index - under development   | Groundwater Vulnerability Index - under development  |
| The Environment & Sustainability<br>Development Indicators Initiative<br>(ESDI)                                  | <ul> <li>Freshwater quality Indicator (water<br/>suitability for major uses such as<br/>aquatic life, recreation and agriculture)</li> <li>Extent of wetlands Indicator (a<br/>comprehensive national wetland<br/>inventory. The area covered by<br/>wetlands is used as a proxy indicator<br/>for biodiversity)</li> </ul> | -  |
| Environment Canada: National<br>Environment Indicator Series<br>(NEIS) - Urban Water Use<br>Indicator            | <ul> <li>Wastewater Treatment</li> <li>Phosphorous loadings in municipal wastewater effluents</li> </ul>  | <ul> <li>Wastewater Treatment</li> <li>Levels of municipal wastewater treatment<br/>(primary, secondary or tertiary)</li> </ul>  |
| Statistics Canada - Human<br>Activity and the Environment:   | <ul> <li>Substances Released into Water (by quantity)</li> <li>Total stream flow</li> <li>Water Intake as share of stream flow in major basins</li> </ul>   | -  |
| North American Commission for<br>Environmental Cooperation<br>(CEC) - State of the North<br>American Environment | Water Quality   | -  |
| North American Commission for<br>Environmental Cooperation<br>(CEC) - Children's Health and the<br>Environment   | -   | <ul> <li>Drinking Water:</li> <li>Percentage of children (households) without access to treated water</li> <li>Percentage of children living in areas served by public water systems in violation of local standards</li> <li>Sanitation:</li> <li>Percentages of children (households) that are not served with sanitary sewers</li> <li>Waterbourne Disease:</li> <li>Morbidity: number of cases of childhood</li> </ul> |

Program on Water Governance, University of British Columbia Page 2 of 10

| North American Commission for<br>Environmental Cooperation<br>(CEC) - Children's Health and the<br>Environment | -   | <ul> <li>Drinking Water:</li> <li>Percentage of children (households) without access to treated water</li> <li>Percentage of children living in areas served by public water systems in violation of local standards</li> <li>Sanitation:</li> <li>Percentages of children (households) that are not served with sanitary sewers</li> <li>Waterbourne Disease:</li> <li>Morbidity: number of cases of childhood illnesses attributed to waterborne diseases (Canada, Mexico, United States)</li> </ul> |
|--|---|--|
| AGENCY INITIATIVE  | ECOSYSTEM HEALTH INDICATORS   | HUMAN HEALTH INDICATORS  |
| PROVINCIAL LEVEL:  |   |  |
| Alberta Environment  | Alberta River Water Quality Index (RWQI) <ul> <li>River Pesticide Index</li> <li>River Nutrient Index</li> <li>River Bacteria Index</li> <li>Metals</li> </ul> Lake Level Index <ul> <li>Lake Trophic Status</li> <li>River Flow Quantity Index</li> </ul> Water Allocations - compared to natural flows  | Drinking Water Safety Indicator <ul> <li>Facility Design</li> <li>Facility Operational Requirements</li> <li>Drinking Water Quality</li> </ul>   |
| BC Ministry of Environment   | <ul> <li>Water Quality Index for surface water<br/>bodies in BC</li> <li>Trends in Surface Water Quality</li> <li>Percentage of Observation Wells that<br/>show declining water levels due<br/>primarily to human activity</li> <li>Number of Heavily Developed Aquifers<br/>in BC</li> <li>Trend in the number of road crossings of<br/>streams in B.C.</li> <li>Economic and conservation tenures in the<br/>Program on Water Governance</li> </ul> | 9,   |
|  | University of British Columbia<br>Page 3 of 10  |  |

|   | The Species Conservation Indicators<br>include information on either freshwater or<br>marine species   | -   |
|---|--|---|
| BC Ministry of Environment,<br>Environment Canada,<br>Universities of BC and Western<br>Ontario plus 3 forest licensees | <ul> <li>Benthic Macroinvertebrate Sustainability<br/>Indicator Development Project<br/>(Benthic invertebrates are an indicator of<br/>water quality and ecosystem health)</li> <li>Water quality biological assessment –<br/>Northern, British Columbia - under<br/>development</li> </ul>                | -   |
| Manitoba Conservation   | Water Quality (based on the CCME WQI)  | The level of water treatment needed for potable purposes – <i>under development</i>                                   |
|   | Fish Species Biodiversity & Population<br>Commercial Fish Harvest Trends   |   |
| New Brunswick Department of<br>Environment  | Quality of Major River Systems as<br>Measured by Annual Average Dissolved<br>Oxygen, Nitrates, and pH Dissolved<br>Oxygen (D.O.)   | Percentage of Post Treatment Tests for<br>Municipal Water Supplies Exceeding Guidelines<br>for Drinking Water Quality |
|   | -  | Percentage of New Private Wells Exceeding<br>Guidelines for Canadian Drinking Water Quality                           |
| Newfoundland and Labrador<br>Department of Environment &  | Water Quality Index (CCME WQI) for the<br>Protection of Aquatic Life   | Drinking Water Quality Index (WQI)  |
| Conservation  | Site Specific Water Quality Index<br>Forestry Water Quality Index  | The Agri-food Water Quality Index (AFWQI)<br>Safe Drinking Water Indicators – <i>under</i><br><i>development</i>      |
|   | Aquaculture Water Quality Index – under development  | -   |
| Northwest Territories   | Freshwater Fish – <b>7 indicators</b> to monitor<br>population sizes and trends:<br><b>SIZE:</b> 1) Population size, 2) number of<br>occurrences, 3) distribution<br><b>TREND:</b> 4) Trend in Population, 5) Trend<br>in Distribution<br><b>THREAT:</b> 6) Threats to population 7)<br>Threats to habitat | -   |
| Northwest Territories –   | Surface water quality  | -   |

Program on Water Governance, University of British Columbia Page 4 of 10

| Environment Canada & INAC                |  |  |
|--|--|--|
| Nova Scotia Department of<br>Environment | CCME WQI for the protection of Aquatic<br>Life   | Drinking Water Quality Index   |
|  | -  | Percentage of population served by municipal<br>water supplies that meet the health-based criteria<br>for bacteriological quality, as stated in the<br>Guidelines for Canadian Drinking Water Quality,<br>at all times during the calendar year.   |
| Ontario                                  | Principle indicators (nitrate and pesticide con<br>under development   | ncentrations) for drinking & surface water quality –   |
|  | Source Water Protection Plans Reporting<br>Guidelines:<br>Watershed:<br>• Water Quality Indicators<br>• Indicators of vulnerable aquifers<br>• Microbial Indicators – source water<br>Groundwater Vulnerability:<br>• Water Quality<br>• Wellhead protection<br>• Vulnerability mapping<br>• Geochemical indicators (water)<br>Surface Water Vulnerability:<br>• Water Quality<br>• Vulnerability Indicators | _  |
| Prince Edward Island                     | Surface Water Quality <ul> <li>Nitrate concentrations in surface water</li> <li>Shellfish closures</li> </ul>  | <ul> <li>Drinking Water Quality</li> <li>Nitrate Concentrations in Private Wells</li> <li>Escherichia coli in Private Wells</li> <li>Water and wastewater central servicing (the number of single family homes that are serviced by a central water supply system and a central wastewater collection and treatment system)</li> </ul> |
|  | <ul> <li>Pesticides</li> <li>Numbers of suspected pesticide-<br/>related fish kills in Island rivers</li> <li>Air Quality</li> </ul>   | -  |

Program on Water Governance, University of British Columbia

Page 5 of 10

|  | Acid Rain  |  |
|--|--|--|
|  | Biodiversity   | -  |
|  | <ul> <li>Protected Land Area</li> </ul>  |  |
| Environment Quebec   | CCME WQI   | Bathing Water Quality  |
| Quebec (various partners):<br>Monitoring the St. Lawrence<br>River | <ul> <li>Contamination of sediments</li> <li>Invasive plant species in freshwater wetlands</li> <li>Quality of shellfish waters in the estuary and gulf</li> <li>Surface area of freshwater wetlands</li> <li>Toxic substances at the inlet and outlet of the fluvial section</li> <li>Contamination of marine resources by toxic substances</li> <li>Monitoring of toxic algae in the estuary and gulf</li> <li>Physico-chemical parameters of water (estuary and gulf)</li> <li>Contamination of freshwater fish by toxic substances</li> <li>Organic toxic substances at the mouths of the Richelieu and Yamaska rivers</li> <li>Physico-chemical and bacteriological parameters of water (river)</li> <li>Water quality in potential freshwater swimming areas</li> <li>Monitoring of freshwater fish</li> </ul> | Water level and flow   |
| Saskatchewan Environment   | <ul> <li>Number of sewage effluent discharges<br/>that represent a risk to source waters</li> <li>Water Quality Index ratings for lakes</li> <li>Water Quality Index ratings for rivers</li> </ul>   | <ul> <li>Per cent of communities with human<br/>consumptive waterworks whose operators<br/>have received some level of certification</li> <li>Per cent of facilities that meet bacteriological<br/>guidelines 90 per cent of the time</li> </ul> |

Program on Water Governance, University of British Columbia

|  |   | <ul> <li>Per cent of waterworks [regulated by<br/>Saskatchewan Environment] that meet<br/>disinfection requirements 90 per cent of the<br/>time</li> <li>Number of waterworks that do not meet<br/>Saskatchewan Environment's minimum<br/>treatment requirements [broken down by pre<br/>and post regulatory changes]</li> <li>Number of accredited drinking water testing<br/>laboratories</li> <li>Number and percentage of municipalities with<br/>bylaws in place to protect their drinking water<br/>supplies</li> <li>Per cent of survey respondents indicating that<br/>they are willing to pay more for their drinking<br/>water</li> <li>Per cent of survey respondents indicating that<br/>they are very or somewhat confident in the<br/>quality of their tap water</li> <li>Number of system owners that publicly</li> </ul> |
|--|---|--|
| Saskatchewan Water Authority                                 | Water Quality Index Values and Ratings for Lakes  | release water quality results<br>-   |
|  | Three Year Average Water Quality Index Values and Ratings for Rivers  | -  |
| CABIN (Yukon)  | Stream Health Indicator   |  |
| AGENCY INITIATIVE  | ECOSYSTEM HEALTH INDICATORS   | HUMAN HEALTH INDICATORS  |
| REGIONAL LEVEL:  |   |  |
| Great Lakes (Superior, Huron,<br>Michigan, Erie and Ontario) | <ul><li>Contamination</li><li>Biotic Communities</li></ul>  | <ul><li>Human Health</li><li>Resource Utilization (wastewater treatment)</li></ul>   |
| Management Plans   | <ul> <li>Coastal Zones</li> <li>Aquatic Habitats</li> <li>Invasive Species</li> <li>Resource Utilization (pollution)</li> </ul> |  |
| Upper Great Lakes Region: GEM<br>Center for Science and      | Groundwater Quality   | Wastewater Treatment   |

Program on Water Governance, University of British Columbia

| Environmental Outreach   |   |   |
|--|---|---|
| Mackenzie River Basin  | CCME WQI – State of the Mackenzie<br>River Aquatic Ecosystem  | -   |
| The Arctic Water Resource<br>Vulnerability Index (AWRVI)                                       |   | An Integrated Assessment Tool for Community<br>Resilience and Vulnerability with respect to<br>Freshwater |
| The Georgia Basin Puget Sound<br>Ecosystem Indicators Project                                  | <ul> <li>River, stream and lake Quality</li> <li>Marine Water Quality</li> <li>Shellfish Indicator</li> </ul>   | -   |
| Gulf of Maine Council on the<br>Marine Environment (GoMC)                                      | The Ecosystem Indicators Partnership<br>(ESIP) is developing indicators of<br>ecosystem integrity. The six indicator<br>areas:<br>• Coastal development<br>• Contaminants and pathogens<br>• Eutrophication<br>• Aquatic habitat<br>• Fisheries and aquaculture, and<br>• Climate change<br>– under development | -   |
| AGENCY INITIATIVE  | ECOSYSTEM HEALTH INDICATORS   | HUMAN HEALTH INDICATORS   |
| COMMUNITY LEVEL:   |   |   |
| Canadian Index of Wellbeing  | Ecosystem health  | -   |
| British Columbia Environmental<br>Network (BCEN) – Toward<br>Sustainability Indicators for BC: | Freshwater & natural resources  | -   |
| Fraser Basin Council –<br>Sustainability Indicators  | <ul> <li>Water Quality Index</li> <li>Water Quality Trends</li> <li>Wastewater Treatment</li> </ul>   | -   |
| Okanagon Basin Water Board<br>(OBWB)   | Environmental base flow in streams and creeks (Kokanee salmon and rainbow trout)  | -   |
| Columbia Basin Trust - Water<br>Quality Report on the Columbia<br>Basin                        | <ul> <li>Point source pollution: municipal<br/>wastewater effluent, industrial effluent,<br/>spills and releases</li> <li>Non-point source pollution: impacts</li> </ul>  | -   |

Program on Water Governance, University of British Columbia

|  | from dams, forestry, agricultures, air<br>pollution, landfills and waste disposal,<br>urban land development, urban runoff  |   |
|--|---|---|
| British Columbia Progress Board<br>– Benchmark Report      | BC Water Quality Index  | -   |
| Petitcodiac Watershed Alliance<br>(New Brunswick)          | <b>7 different indicators</b> are used to assess<br>the health of the Petitcodiac River<br>ecosystem.   | -   |
| NWT Land Use Planning Boards                               | Water Quality   | -   |
| Genuine Progress Index (GPI)<br>(Nova Scotia)              | Drinking Water Quality (based on the Guidelines for Drinking Water Quality)   | -   |
| Clean Annapolis River Project<br>(CARP) (Nova Scotia)      | River water quality   | -   |
| Grand River Conservation<br>Authority                      | Water Quality (using the CCME WQI)  | <ul><li>Stream flow</li><li>Rainfall</li><li>Reservoir levels</li></ul>   |
| Ontario – City of Hamilton<br>Sustainability Indicators    | <ul> <li>Total Loading of Ammonia to Hamilton<br/>Harbour (measured at Municipal<br/>Woodward Avenue Sewage Treatment<br/>Plant)</li> <li>Total Loading of Phosphorus to<br/>Hamilton Harbour (measured at<br/>Municipal Woodward Avenue Sewage<br/>Treatment Plant)</li> <li>Percentage of "Beaches Days Open<br/>for Swimming"</li> </ul> | Total Water Consumption for All Uses<br>(metered accounts)  |
| Association of Public Health<br>Epidemiologists in Ontario | -   | <ul> <li>The number of boil water advisories (BWAs) by household-days affected</li> <li>The number of drinking water advisories (DWAs) by household-days affected</li> <li>Drinking water quality exceedences for health parameters</li> <li>Trihalomethanes (THMs) in drinking water</li> <li>Coliform bacteria in drinking water</li> <li>E.coli in drinking water</li> <li>Fluoride in drinking water</li> </ul> |

Program on Water Governance, University of British Columbia

Page 9 of 10

| Association of Public Health<br>Epidemiologists in Ontario                                | -  | <ul> <li>The number of boil water advisories (BWAs) by household-days affected</li> <li>The number of drinking water advisories (DWAs) by household-days affected</li> <li>Drinking water quality exceedences for health parameters</li> <li>Trihalomethanes (THMs) in drinking water</li> <li>Coliform bacteria in drinking water</li> <li>E.coli in drinking water</li> <li>Fluoride in drinking water</li> <li>Percentage of households on private wells</li> <li>Percentage of households with a deep drilled well</li> <li>Percentage of households with a private well that has been tested for bacteria at least three times in the past 12 months</li> </ul> |
|---|--|--|
| Pembina Institute: Ontario<br>Community Sustainability Report<br>(The Smart Growth Index) |  | % of population served with tertiary water<br>treatment  |
| The CLEAR Network: Community<br>of London Environmental<br>Awareness Reporting Network    | <ul> <li>Sewage plant efficiency (removing phosphorus)</li> <li>Sewage treatment bypass</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Consumption per person</li> <li>Drinking water testing (adverse samples)</li> <li>Drinking water losses (non-revenue water)</li> <li>Volume of Sewage per person (per capita)</li> </ul>  |